CITY OF HOUSTON

City Council

To: Director Melissa Dubowski

Date: February 1, 2024

Subject: Outcome-based budgeting performance measures

From: Sallie Alcorn, Council Member At-Large 5

Director Dubowski,

As we discussed, my team and I have been reviewing the FY24 approved budget and related performance measures. Below are our comments, questions, and suggestions. Please know these are just suggestions and by no means are meant to be a directive. Our goal here is simply to make sure departments come up with performance measures meaningful to the public -- measures which clearly demonstrate how effective each department division is carrying out its responsibilities.

I am not intricately involved in each division's responsibilities, so I understand if some of what is suggested does not fit, needs refined, or is too cumbersome to address. I do hope, however, that some of this will be incorporated into the performance measures included in the FY25 budget.

Note: If we do not specifically address a performance measure already listed in the budget, this means we feel it is a good measure to continue including in the budget as currently written. We only address measures which should be added, changed, or more clearly explained. The rest are fine.

Many thanks for your consideration. Please contact me with any questions.

Administration and Regulatory Affairs Department
- Animal services division
  - Add performance measures (PMs) associated with microchipping and spay/neuter.

City Council
- City council offices division
  - Add PMs associated with:
    - Constituent services – number of residents assisted/cases closed
    - Ordinances created/amended through council committee work
    - Community events and public initiatives
    - Digital outreach engagement metrics (i.e., newsletters)

<u>**Department of Neighborhoods**</u>
- Code enforcement division
  - "Junk motor vehicles resolved" – consider using percentages. How many junk motor vehicle issues resolved vs number reported?
  - "Weeded lots cut" – same as above
  - Add PM associated with bandit sign abatement.
- Community engagement division
  - "Number of constituent calls for service" – need another metric on how many calls routed and/or resolved.
  - "Number of council inquiries answered, routed, and/or resolved by community liaisons and/or community coordinators" – need another metric on how many calls routed and/or resolved vs number received.

<u>**Finance Department**</u>
- Accounting division
  - "Cost per invoice" – Are we trying to lower it? What is the goal associated with this PM?
- Capital projects and debt management division
  - "Review all out outstanding debt annually for purposes of identifying refunding opportunities" – how is this target number of four credits determined?
- Citywide procurement and contract management division
  - These are good PMs, but we are not meeting them. What adjustments are being made to meet these FY24 targets?
  - Add PMs associated with direct procurements vs. cooperative purchasing.
  - Add PM related to Hire Houston First businesses.
  - Add PM related to creation of procurement manual and other policy documents.
- Energy management division
  - "Tree planting initiative" – what is the source of this data?
- Financial management services division
  - Add PM associated with satisfaction rate from client departments.
- Grants division
  - Across all departments, add PM associated with number of grants awarded vs number of applications made.
- Performance improvement division
  - Number of in-house consulting engagements at 24 – how do we measure effectiveness? Consider including number of recommendations implemented per engagement.
  - Number of lean six sigma green belts certified – is this citywide?
- Treasury division
  - "Variance of mixed beverage tax budget to actual/estimate" – why is the variance so high?

Fleet Management Department

- Fleet asset management division
  - "Performance reports issued per schedule" – what is this schedule? What does it tell us?
- Fleet operations division
  - "Preventative maintenance inspections performed within target interval" – what is the target interval?
- Fleetshare management division
  - "# of vehicles inspected annually for quality and reliability" – out of how many? Include a percentage for this measurement. Are we behind or on track?
- Fuel management division
  - Add PM associated with tracking fuel purchases and reducing fuel consumption.
- Human capital management division
  - "Employee training hours" – is this number of training hours sufficient/in line with industry standard?
  - "FMD policies/procedures completed" – provide more information.
  - "QA processes and inspections" – should we be doing more or is this meeting our goal? Need a metric that shows if this number is sufficient.
- Outside services division
  - "Invoices processed: early pay discounts" – add information about the amount of savings generated in discounts.
- Parts management division
  - Explain inventory accuracy and adjustments.
  - "Part availability: 'A' Classification Parts" – what is this? Are there other classifications that should also be included?

General Services Department

- Energy management division
  - Add PM associated with number of initiatives implemented across all city buildings.
- Facilities design and construction division
  - Add PM associated with number of projects completed per third party project manager.
- Facilities environmental management division
  - Add PM associated with reducing backlog/increase rate with oil/water separators.
- Facilities maintenance division
  - "Number of contract amendments" – explain this PM.
  - "Number of maintenance work orders" – consider changing this to percentages so we can see what percentage of work orders are closed vs how many are submitted.
  - Add PMs associated with progress on addressing deficiencies identified in the facility conditions assessment report.
- Facilities security division
  - Add PM associated with initiatives to improve security at city buildings.
- Real estate management division

- o "Rental checks received every month" – please explain the relevance of this metric. Are we looking to increase or decrease this number?
- o Add PMs associated with expediting acquisition, disposition, and leasing of city real estate.

Houston Airport System

- Commercial development division
  - o Add PMs associated with other non-airline revenue drivers – terminal, auto rental concessions, and facility rentals.
- Operations management
  - o The number of discrepancies is listed in the performance column in all three PMs.

Houston Emergency Center

- Administrative services division
  - o Add PM associated with recruiting employees – example: how many job fairs?
- Emergency call center – 911 division
  - o Add PM associated with how long on average it takes to respond to both non-emergency and emergency calls; create a metric related to decreasing these numbers.
- Emergency management division
  - o "Activation and preparedness" – explain this metric.
  - o Add PM associated with number of lily pads and resiliency hubs implemented.
  - o Add PM associated with how many members of the public are engaged each year through various interactions.

Houston Fire Department

- Community fire prevention and risk reduction division
  - o "Arson clearance rate" – we cleared 24% in FY23, but the FY24 target remains at 22%. Why reduce the clearance rate?
  - o "Number of inspection activities" – similar question to the above. Shouldn't we want to increase our target?
  - o "Number of juvenile FireStopper referrals" – same question as above.
  - o "Number of Public Education sessions" – same question as above.
  - o "Number of smoke alarm installs" – same question as above.
  - o Add PM associated with activities of the fire marshal unit.
- Emergency response and rescue division
  - o Describe what "incidents" are. There should be a separate number of EMS incidents and Fire incidents.
- Executive services division
  - o "Classified attrition" – Why keep this target flat and not reduce?
  - o "Number of cadets that start training" – add PM associated with increasing the number of cadets who complete training.

Houston Health Department

- Chronic disease prevention and management division
  - Add PM to indicate how many residents are participating in public health programming.
  - Add PMs related to activities and programming to address diabetes, hypertension, obesity, and tobacco use – example: number of initiatives to address & to measure the effectiveness of these programs.
  - How many clinic visits?
- Community center operations division
  - Add PMs which describe effectiveness of this division in attracting and engaging neighborhood participation.
- Criminal rehab and prevention division
  - Add PMs associated with the credible messenger program.
- Disease control and prevention division
  - Add PMs to gauge effectiveness of implemented programming.
- Food safety division
  - "Number of food facility inspections completed" – how many restaurants being inspected vs. how many in our system? What percentage of food facility inspections are being completed annually? Are we meeting targets?
  - "Percentage of food establishments inspected within 30 days of the risk-adjusted due date" – what does risk-adjusted due date mean?
  - Add PM addressing length of time it takes to get a food facility inspection during the permitting process?
- Health education and outreach division
  - Add PMs associated with effectiveness of education and intervention efforts.
  - How many participants are being reached?
- Human services division
  - Add PMs associated with programming to promote healthy behaviors, facilitating individual/family assessment and care coordination, community mobilization projects, and coordination of recreational and social activities.
  - How many participants are being reached?
- Pharmacy services division
  - "Number of medications dispensed to patients treated in clinical services" – this target for FY 2024 seems low. Why are we trying to reduce medication dispensation by over 60,000?
  - Add PMs associated with accuracy in dispensation.
- Special waste division
  - Add PMs associated with fat, oils, and grease inspections completed annually.
- Swimming pool safety and permitting division
  - Add PM associated with length of time to issue a pool investigation permit.
- Vital statistics division
  - "Number of individual certified birth and death records issued per year" – this is not a number we can control. Need a PM associated with the effective and timely issuance of birth and death records.

Houston Information Technology Services
- Citywide customer service request – 311 program division
  - Add PM associated with opening, responding to, and closing out of 311 calls made through web and mobile channels.

Houston Parks and Recreation Department
- Adaptive sports and recreation division
  - Add PM related to effectiveness of efforts to increase participation.
- Aquatic centers operation division
  - Add PM associated with efforts to increase lifeguard participation.
  - Add PM associated with efforts to ensure all pools are opened in the summer.
- Executive oversight division
  - "Number of grants received" – out of how many applied? What percentage of grant applications are being awarded?
  - "Media releases" – why keep this target down if we have exceeded last year's target?
  - Add PM showing number of residents were reached through media releases and other communication efforts.
- Facilities maintenance division
  - "Facility work orders completed" – out of how many received? Als, add PM related to the average length of time it takes to complete a facility work order?
  - "Park sites improved" – why keep this target flat?
- Park safety and security division
  - Add PM related to how long it takes to respond to and resolve these calls.
- Urban forestry division
  - Add PM related to how long it takes to respond to a forestry call for service, and how long it takes to investigate and resolve issue.

Houston Police Department
- Administrative services division
  - Remove target numbers in PM descriptions.
  - "Perform a minimum of 50 divisional process audits annually" – include PM related to improvements implemented per audit. How are measuring the effectiveness of these audits?
- Airport systems division
  - "Decrease annual auto thefts and burglaries on airport and surrounding properties" – If the goal is to decrease auto thefts, shouldn't the number reflected in the target be less than the prior year estimate?
  - "Decrease response time to Priority 3 calls…" – same question as above
- Community outreach and victim services division
  - FY 24 target for DART same as FY 23 target.
  - Add PM related to effectiveness of these victim services programs, like DART.
  - What percentage of DART calls are responded to by DART officers?
  - How many patrol officers have domestic abuse/violence sensitivity training?

- o "Increase positive interaction program (PIP) participation" – why lower the FY24 target from the FY23 estimate?
- Homeland security/special events division
  - o "Maintain responsibility capabilities to special events annually" – how is it quantified?
  - o Add PM related to drills/practices for potential threats.
- Investigations division
  - o Add PM related to reviewing/verifying gang-related crimes.
  - o Add PM related to clearance rates for various categories of crime.
- Mental health division
  - o "Reduce number of chronic consumer repeat callers annually" – the FY24 target should be less than previous year's target and estimate.
  - o "Reduce number of officer responses to non-law-enforcement events annually" - please explain this PM and provide an example of a non-law enforcement event.
    - ▪ Reduce the FY24 target if successful in FY23 estimate.
  - o Add PM related to clinic officer remote evaluation.
  - o Add PM related enforcement of trespassing affidavits.
- Police patrol division
  - o In both PMs, adjust targets to improve response times instead of maintaining.
- Support division
  - o "Maintain error rate below 3%..." – If maintaining 3% or less is the goal, and that was achieved in FY23's estimate at 1%, then the FY24 target should be lowered.
  - o "Maintain percentage of property submitted in under 30 minutes"
    - ▪ Add PM associated with disposal rate and items coming in annually.
    - ▪ Add PM related to property evidence received vs. evidence disposed. What is the current ratio and how are we trying to lower it?
- Traffic enforcement division
  - o "Increase traffic enforcement and mobility in high-incident areas" – shouldn't the FY24 target be higher than FY23 estimate if the goal is to increase?
  - o "Reduce percentage vehicle, bicycle, and pedestrian fatalities" – shouldn't the FY24 target be lower than the FY23 estimate if goal is to reduce percentage?
  - o Add PMs related to initiatives like street racing enforcement as well as "safe roadways."
- Training division
  - o Add PM related to reducing cadet attrition.
  - o "Meet percentage of TCOLE legally required pass rate on first attempt for police cadets" – clarify this goal.
  - o Add PM related to recruitment.
  - o Add PM related to continuing education.

Houston Public Library

- Digital strategies division
    - Add PM related to number of online check-outs.
    - Add PM related to number of patrons with tech link certification.
- Library collection division
    - "Cost of circulation & distribution of library materials" – what does this goal mean? Do we want to increase or decrease the target?
    - Add PM related to average number of check-outs per item.
- Library operations division
    - Add PM associated with annual number of training and development opportunities.
- Library spaces division
    - "Annual cost of library furniture cleaning, refurbishing and repair" – is there something actively being done to lower this number? It seems like a budget line item, not a target.
- Literacy and educational program division
    - Add PM associated with literacy program completion and effectiveness.
- Historic preservation fund division
    - Identify which historic library buildings are considered historic buildings within HPL.

Human Resources

- Contingent workforce management division
    - "Monthly program run rate for special projects requiring contingent workers" – a budget line item, not a goal or target. Add PMs associated with this programming.
- Employee benefits administration division
    - Add PM related to usage of new employee wellness center in City Hall basement.
- HR client services division
    - All categories – why do targets and estimates remain flat?
    - "Time to fill (days) – average number of days from requisition posting to job offer for a fiscal year.
        - I asked this question during FY24 budget workshops and was told 112 so <90 cannot be correct.
        - Add PM with a target to bring this number down.
    - Add PM related to acceptance rate of job offers.
    - Add PM related to production and release of compensation study.
- Risk management division
    - "Facility safety inspections and work site observations…" – add PM related to the corrective measures resulting from these inspections and observations.
- Talent & organization development
    - Add PM related to increasing participation.

Houston Public Works

- Capital improvement program division
  - Add PM related to number of lane miles being reconstructed/improved.
  - Add PM related to improvements in water/wastewater system.
- Commercial, residential and right-of-way inspections division
  - Add PM related to 15-day SLA for commercial plans.
  - Add PM related to reducing the number of plan resubmittals.
  - Add PMs associated with identified disciplines: water, wastewater, traffic, floodplain, stormwater, telecommunications, etc.
  - Add PM related to ensuring timely and accurate inspections.
  - Add PM related to reducing wait times for inspections.
- TranStar division
  - Add PM related to increasing public awareness and use of TranStar services.
  - Add PM related to traffic reduction and traffic accident reduction.
- Mayor's office of people with disabilities division
  - "Number of pedestrian accessibility review programs/sidewalk repair applications reviewed and processed."
    - Add PM related to lane miles and sidewalks improved through PAR.
  - Add PM related to ADA self-evaluation and transition plan implementation.
- Metering and customer service operations division
  - "Utility customer calls answered within five minutes" – add PM associated with how many calls are resolved and average time from first contact to resolution.
  - Add PM associated with how many bills are calculated by estimation.
  - Add PM related to number of manual reads.
  - Add PM related to progress on upgrading remote reading devices.
  - Add PM associated with transition to paperless billing – how many residents are online billing, and how much savings generated?
  - Add PM related to customer service – example: surveys, number of complaints.
- Transportation & drainage operations division
  - Include percentages for these categories – example: 25,000 miles of gutters swept out of total number of miles.
  - Most categories – If we keep hitting our target, why not increase our target in FY24? All columns here are flat.
  - Add PM associated with how many lane miles of concrete panel replacements.
  - Add PM related to the new roadside re-establishment – are we on target for our five-year inspection and re-establishment cycle?
    - Add PM related to basin maintenance.
    - Add PM related to re-establishment.
    - Add PM related to rehabilitation.
  - Add PM related to maintaining/upgrading urban drainage – example: inlets, storm sewers.
- Wastewater operations division
  - Most categories – same comments as TDO. If we keep hitting our target, why not increase our target in FY24? All columns here are flat.
  - Add PM associated with reducing sanitary sewer overflows.
  - Add PM related to water reuse sales.

Legal Department
- General litigation division
  - Add PM related to successful litigation conclusions (in city's favor) by percentage.
- Labor, employment, and civil service division
  - Add PM related to success rate of defending against EEOC/TWC by percentage.
- Municipal prosecution division
  - Referring to the goal described on the divisional budget detail page, how do you measure that outcomes achieved are for the betterment of Houston citizens?
  - Add PM related to successful adjudication of city ordinances.
  - Add PM related to number of cases resolved, affirming city-issued citations.
  - Add PM related to adjudication of bar & nightclub noise violations.
- Neighborhood services division
  - "Number of dangerous building orders and emergency review approvals presented to Building Standard Commission or Hearing official" – what percentage of reported dangerous buildings are processed through?
  - "Number of deed restrictions reviewed and enforced" – what percentage of total number reported?
- OIG division
  - Add PMs associated with police transparency hub/dashboard.
  - Add PMs associated with public engagement initiatives of the office of policing reform and accountability.
- Real estate division
  - Add PM associated with length of time to process these agreements, dedications, and transactions.
- Torts & civil rights division
  - Add PM related to the success of cases defended.

Municipal Courts Department
- Cash management services division
  - Add PM related to passport processing services.
- Collections and compliance division
  - Add PM related to the number of deferred payment program users.
  - Add PM related to percentage collected through external vendors.
- Judicial operations division
  - Add PM associated with number of times a case is reset or rescheduled.
  - What is the target timeframe between citation issued and first court date?
  - "Court efficiency through the percentage of overall cases disposed vs. cases filed" – please explain.
- Public information division
  - "Annual number of open records requests processed" – good information to have, but not something the department has control over. Add PM related to how average length of time it takes to process an open records request.
- Truancy prevention youth engagement
  - Add PM related to the success of this program.

Office of Business Opportunity
- Business support and development
  - Add PM related to the success of this program – example: satisfaction survey
- Workforce development division
  - "Number of attendees at the Turnaround Houston Job and Readiness Fairs" – add PMs associated with outcomes such as jobs offered at the fair. What about long-term effectiveness and tracking?

Planning and Development Department
- Administrative services division
  - Add PM related to how many residents reached through mailouts and digital outreach.
- Community and regional services division
  - "Number of lots protected by special minimum lot size, building line, and prohibited yard parking programs annually" – FY24 target should be above FY23 estimate if we are meeting target.
    - Are expirations considered in this number?
    - Add PM associated with percentage of new applications approved annually vs how many applications received.
- Development services and design review division
  - "Percentage of commercial applications reviewed annually" – add PM associated with average number of resubmittals and average number of days it takes to review (SLA).
  - "Percentage of residential applications reviewed annually" – add PM associated with average number of resubmittals and average number of days it takes to review (SLA).
- Transportation planning division
  - Add PM related to recommendations implemented in Bike Houston/Vision Zero plans.

Solid Waste Management Department
- Some performance measure descriptions include the target – please review and only list target in target column.
- Curbside recycling collections division
  - Add PM associated with average number of trips to recycling center/transfer station per driver.
  - Add PM associated with average time for driver to complete route.
  - Add PM associated with average time it takes to resolve (service) a missed recycling service request.
  - Add PM associated with average overtime amount per route, per quadrant.
- Residential waste collections division
  - Add PM associated with average number of trips to landfill per driver.
  - Add PM associated with average time for driver to complete route.
  - Add PM associated with average time it takes to resolve (service) a missed garbage service request.
  - Add PM associated with average overtime amount per route, per quadrant.